Concluding Remarks

# Pairwise Trading in the Money Market during the European Sovereign Debt Crisis

#### **Edoardo Rainone**

(Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016



The views expressed in the paper are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the Bank of Italy or the Eurosystem.

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

### Table of Contents

Motivation

Econometric Model

Data

**Empirical Analysis** 

**Concluding Remarks** 

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

### Table of Contents

#### Motivation

Econometric Model

Data

**Empirical Analysis** 

**Concluding Remarks** 

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) < □ ▶ < □ ▶ < ■ ▶ < ■ ▶ < ■ ▶ = つへで BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 3 / 45

1\/1	ot	114	at.	IOP	
	U.		au	101	

# Motivation

- Banks keep reserves at the central bank
  - to manage the reserve requirement, settle transactions and earn interests.
- The unsecured money market was the most important channel to reallocate liquidity
  - before the recent financial crises.
- Crucial market for monetary policy, banking theory and the economics of payments.
- Average rates in this market (EURIBOR, EONIA, ..) affect banks decisions concerning loans to businesses and families,
  - making it crucial also for macroeconomics and finance.
- Great attention was paid to the variation of money market aggregate outcomes during the recent sovereign debt crises.

# Aggregate Evidence $[y_t]$





(a) Number of trades

(b) Total quantity exchanged



Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

(c) Average rate

ъ BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 5 / 45

э

Motivation

Concluding Remarks

# Market Side Evidence $[y_{l/b,t}]$

#### Number of trades



Median, Interquartile range (dark shades), Interdecile range (light shades)

Concluding Remarks

# Market Side Evidence $[y_{l/b,t}]$

Rates



(f) Lenders

(g) Borrowers

Median, Interquartile range (dark shades), Interdecile range (light shades)

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) 

# Pairwise Evidence $[y_{ij,t}]$ ?

#### **OTC** Market

• Decentralized market, not anonymous bilateral trades.



- Aggregate figures are functions of pairwise outcomes.
   EONIA<sub>t</sub> = E[p<sub>ij,t</sub>], trading volume<sub>t</sub> = N<sub>t</sub> \* E[q<sub>ij,t</sub>].
- $y_{ij,t} = f(x_{i,t}, x_{j,t}, \beta), \ y_{ij,t} = p_{ij,t}, q_{ij,t}, I_{ij,t}.$
- Scope of this paper: estimate  $\beta$
- But first, how to estimate  $\beta$ ?

# Why are these $\beta$ s so important?

- Evidences coming from such an analysis could be used if we are interested in assessing European market fragmentation (de Andoain et al., 2014; Mayordomo et al., 2015), segregation or integration, as well as explaining rate dispersion (Gaspar et al., 2008) and supply concentration, for instance.
- This is an important issue when banks are highly heterogeneous and belong to different nations. An high fragmentation may prevent a **smooth and homogeneous pass-through mechanism**.

Motivation

Concluding Remarks

# Related Literature

- Empirical and theoretical literature on **liquidity hoarding and counterparty credit risk**, see Afonso et al. (2011), Angelini et al. (2011), Heider et al. (2015), Caballero and Krishnamurthy (2008), Acharya and Skeie (2011);
- Large number of theories proposed to explain the features of bilateral trades in OTC markets (see Afonso and Lagos, 2015; Bech and Monnet, 2016; Blasques et al., 2016; Duffie et al., 2005, among the others);
- The empirical literature still lacks in providing **formal** econometric models and evidences to better understand these pairwise outcomes.

(日)、

Motivation

Data

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

# Contribution

- Empirical analysis (estimate β): Empirically study the evolution of pairwise trading outcomes in the unsecured interbank market for euro funds during the European sovereign debt crisis;
  - Estimate the effects of nationality and balance sheet structure on the probability to trade, and on bilateral rates and quantities.
- Econometric modelling (how to estimate β):
   Dyadic econometric model for money market pairwise outcomes.

(日)、

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

### Table of Contents

#### Motivation

#### Econometric Model

#### Data

**Empirical Analysis** 

**Concluding Remarks** 

### A Decentralized Market with Counterparty-risk Uncertainty

$$y_{ij,t} = f(x_{i,t}, x_{j,t}, \beta), \ y_{ij,t} = I_{ij,t}, q_{ij,t}, p_{ij,t}.$$



- Iii A link is possible under a non-random meeting process
- q<sub>ij</sub> The exchanged quantity is influenced by non-random liquidity shocks
- p<sub>ij</sub> The rate reflects non-random monitoring and searching costs or default risk

# Non-random unobservable features

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 13 / 45

# Monitoring, Searching and Last Resort Counterparty

Suppose that the central bank sets a interest rate corridor with  $p_{OD}$  and  $p_{ML}$ 

Borrower payoff

$$\pi_b = p_{ML} - (p_{lb} + s_{b,l}) \tag{1}$$

Lender payoff

$$\pi_{l} = i_{lb}(\hat{PD}_{l}(b)) - m_{l,b} - s_{l,b} - p_{OD}$$
<sup>(2)</sup>

Suppose bank *i* receives an exogenous liquidity shock  $\xi_i$  that may represent client's payments or cash withdrawals.

#### Nash equilibrium interest rate and the liquidity exchanged

$$\tilde{p}_{lb} = \operatorname{argmax} f(\pi_l, \pi_b, \mu_l, \mu_b, w_{lb})$$
(3)

$$\tilde{q}_{lb} = \operatorname{argmax} h(\xi_l, \xi_b, y_{lb}) \tag{4}$$

- $\mu_I$  and  $\mu_b$  are the borrower and lender bargaining powers;
- $w_{lb}$  and  $y_{lb}$  are sets of observable and unobservable pair-specific characteristics.

# A Dyadic Econometric Model with Shadow Rates

Suppose that the rate function is linear in its arguments

$$p_{lb} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{lb} + \alpha q_{lb} + \epsilon_{lb}, \tag{5}$$

observed if only if  $\pi_l \geq 0 \cap \pi_b \geq 0$ .

Let bank j have two **shadow rates** one as lender and one as borrower,  $p_{L,ik}^{\ast}$  and  $p_{B,ik}^{\ast}$  respectively,

$$p_{B,b}^{*} = \theta_{0l} + \theta_{1} z_{lb} + \theta_{2b} q_{lb} + \theta_{3} k_{b} + u_{B},$$
(6)

$$p_{L,I}^* = \gamma_{0b} + \gamma_1 z_{Ib} + \gamma_{2I} q_{Ib} + \gamma_3 k_I + u_L.$$
(7)

A loan and its rate are observed if  $I(p_{lb} \ge p_{L,l}^*)I(p_{B,b}^* \ge p_{lb}) = 1$ .

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

# A Dyadic Econometric Model with Shadow Rates

Each pair of banks is thus characterized by a **plausible rate-quantity region**, that is the intersection between the two areas respectively upper and lower-countered by (6) and (7).



### A Dyadic Econometric Model with Shadow Rates

$$p_{lb} = p_{lb}^* s_l s_b,$$

$$p_{lb}^* = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{lb} + \alpha q_{lb} + \epsilon_{lb},$$

$$s_l = l(s_l^* \ge 0),$$

$$s_b = l(s_b^* \ge 0),$$

$$s_l^* = \omega r_l + v_L,$$

$$s_b^* = \lambda r_b + v_B,$$

$$(\epsilon_{lb}, v_B, v_L) \sim f\left( \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} \sigma_{\epsilon} & \sigma_{\epsilon v_B} & \sigma_{\epsilon v_L}\\\sigma_{\epsilon v_L} & \sigma_{v_B v_L} & \sigma_{v_L} \end{bmatrix} \right),$$
(8)

 $E[p_{lb}|s_b = 1, s_l = 1] = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{lb} + \alpha q_{lb} + E[\epsilon_{lb}|s_b = 1, s_l = 1], \quad (9)$ 

where  $E[\epsilon_{lb}|s_b = 1, s_l = 1]$  may be different from zero, generating the selectivity bias.

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ◆□ → < 団 → < 三 → < 三 → 三 → ○ へ (~ BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 17 / 45

# A Simple Example with Unobservable Costs

- $x_b = \{0, 1\}$ , 1 if the borrower is in country A,  $\beta_b > 0$  (riskier).
- Searching costs are different from zero only for banks in country A -i.e.  $s_1 > s_0 = 0$ -. Rates for country A are upper bounded.
- $\epsilon_{lb}$  is correlated with  $s_b$ .

#### **Endogenous Borrower Searching Costs**



• 
$$E(p_{lb}|x_b=0) - E(p_{lb}|x_b=1)$$
 is zero instead of  $\beta_{b}$ 

(Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 18 / 45

Motivation

Data

Empirical Analysi

Concluding Remarks

### Estimators

• Parametric Estimation (multivariate Mills ratios)

$$\begin{split} E[p_{lb}|s_{b} = 1, s_{l} = 1] &= \beta_{0} + \beta_{1}x_{lb} + \alpha q_{lb} \end{split} \tag{10} \\ &+ \frac{\sigma_{\epsilon v_{B}}}{\sigma_{v_{B}}^{2}} \frac{\phi(\kappa^{*}r_{b})\Phi((\omega^{*}r_{l} - \rho_{v_{B}v_{L}}\kappa^{*}r_{b})/(1 - \rho_{v_{B}v_{L}}^{2})^{\frac{1}{2}})}{\Phi^{2}(\kappa^{*}r_{b}, \omega^{*}r_{l}, \rho_{v_{B}v_{L}})} \\ &+ \frac{\sigma_{\epsilon v_{L}}}{\sigma_{v_{L}}^{2}} \frac{\phi(\omega^{*}r_{l})\Phi((\kappa^{*}r_{b} - \rho_{v_{B}v_{L}}\omega^{*}r_{l})/(1 - \rho_{v_{B}v_{L}}^{2})^{\frac{1}{2}})}{\Phi^{2}(\kappa^{*}r_{b}, \omega^{*}r_{l}, \rho_{v_{B}v_{L}})}, \end{split}$$

• Semiparametric Estimation (power series)

$$E[p_{lb}|s_b = 1, s_l = 1] = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{lb} + \alpha q_{lb} + \sum_{k=1}^q \gamma_k \tau_{lb}^{k-1}.$$
 (11)

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 19 / 45

- 32

・ロト ・個ト ・モト ・モト

Concluding Remarks

### Table of Contents

Motivation

Econometric Model

#### Data

**Empirical Analysis** 

**Concluding Remarks** 

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) 

#### **Bilateral trades**

The market for CB money is generated by the reserve requirement and liquidity needs (on the demand side) and has CB RTGS system as an institutionally designed support, as standard in modern economic systems.



From **TARGET2** data we can identify loans applying the Furfine (1999) algorithm, see Arciero et al. (2013) when *i* is strictly positive and Rainone and Vacirca (2015) when they can be zero or negative. Banks covariates are from Bankscope.

Data

Concluding Remarks

#### **Covariates** Balance sheet composition

Maintenance period			2009-03-11 - 2009-04-07			
Variable	Description	mean	std	min	max	
Loan						
Rate	Interest rate paid	0.83	0.20	0.21	2.50	
Quantity	Quantity exchanged (millions)	16.19	53.42	0.05	1033.16	
Lender						
A loan	Loans expressed as percentages of lender total assets	0.57	0.20	0.00	0.90	
A fix as	Fixed assets expressed as percentages of lender total assets	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.14	
A non ern	Non -earning assets expressed as percentages of lender to-	0.07	0.07	0.00	0.96	
L dep sh fun	Deposits and short-term funding expressed as percentages of lender total assets	0.62	0.17	0.00	0.99	
L oth int bea	Other interest bearing liabilities expressed as percentages of lender total assets	0.25	0.17	0.00	0.87	
L oth res	Other reserves expressed as percentages of lender total as-	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.13	
L equ	Equity expressed as percentages of lender total assets	0.08	0.04	0.00	0.60	
A tot asset	Total assets expressed in millions of euros	10.00	2.22	3.06	14.54	

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ◆□ → < 団 → < 三 → < 三 → < 三 → ○ へ ○</p>
BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 22 / 45

Data

#### **Covariates** Nationality

Maintenance period			2009-03-11 - 2009-04-07				
Variable	Description	mean	std	min	max		
IT	Dummy variable taking value equal to 1 if the lender is from this country (or set of countries) and zero otherwise.	0.44	0.50	0.00	1.00		
FR	""	0.05	0.21	0.00	1.00		
ES		0.05	0.22	0.00	1.00		
NL		0.03	0.16	0.00	1.00		
GR		0.03	0.16	0.00	1.00		
IE		0.02	0.13	0.00	1.00		
UK		0.02	0.13	0.00	1.00		
US/JAP/EX		0.03	0.16	0.00	1.00		
AT		0.06	0.24	0.00	1.00		
PT		0.04	0.19	0.00	1.00		
LU		0.01	0.11	0.00	1.00		
CY		0.01	0.11	0.00	1.00		
СН		0.00	0.07	0.00	1.00		
FI		0.00	0.06	0.00	1.00		
EUEX		0.08	0.27	0.00	1.00		
BE		0.00	0.06	0.00	1.00		

#### Time span

from may 2008 to the end of  $2012_{\text{P}}$ , z = 1

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 23 / 45

э

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

### Table of Contents

**Motivation** 

Econometric Model

Data

**Empirical Analysis** 

**Concluding Remarks** 

### Probability to trade - Lender balance sheet



Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ▲□▶ < @▶ < 意▶ < 意▶ BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 25 / 45

### Probability to trade - Borrower balance sheet



Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ◆□ ト (部) く 注 ト く 注 ト 注 の Q (\* BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 26 / 45

### Probability to trade - Lender nationality



### Probability to trade - Borrower nationality



### Rates - Borrower nationality



### Rates - Lender nationality



### Quantities - Lender nationality



### Quantities - Borrower nationality















Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

### Table of Contents

Motivation

Econometric Model

Data

**Empirical Analysis** 

**Concluding Remarks** 

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) 

# Concluding Remarks

- **Dyadic model with shadow rates** to simultaneously study link formation, rates and quantities;
  - Bias emerging when the **counterparties endogenously select each other** into bilateral trades, for example when monitoring and searching efforts are endogenous.
- Study the trade patterns during the European debt crises.
  - Remarkable cross-sectional and time variation, **shedding light on new aspects** featuring the unsecured money market for euro funds.

(日)、

Motivation

Data

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

# THANK YOU!

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ◆□ → < 団 → < 三 → < 三 → 三 → ○ Q (?) BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 35 / 45 Motivation

Data

Empirical Analysis

Concluding Remarks

# Appendix

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶ ▲ ■ ▶ ▲ ■ ▶ ▲ ■ ◇ Q ○
BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 36 / 45

# Snapshot (2010-01-20 - 2010-02-09) - Quantities

	Simple r	Simple regression		Selection correction		ifference
Mills Borrower			-115.01	99*** 051)		
Mills Lender	(23.9951) -85.5174 *** (17.8718)					
	Lender	Borrower	Lender	Borrower	Lender	Borrower
A loan	6.3986	-6.1036	-0.8143	-14.1645 *	0.6512	0.6644
A fix as	-205.9081	-214.8743	-144.4210	-27.0155	-0.2707	-0.7261
A non ern	(101.9778) 66.8535 **	-67.6508 **	(159.2448) 73.2480 ***	-72.5851 **	-0.1600	0.1076
L dep sh fun	(28.5485) 34.8874 (26.3047)	(32.7724) -44.4600 (29.4818)	(27.9638) 18.3525 (25.9386)	(32.0641) -19.3109 (29.4155)	[ 0.4365 ] 0.4476 [ 0.6727 ]	[ 0.5428 ] -0.6039 [ 0.2730 ]
L oth int bea	34.4045	-37.5091	30.1779	-23.8505	0.1122	-0.3289
L oth res	-94.2805	-464.5184	-26.2109	-478.2933	-0.1601	0.0284
L equ	26.2915	55.8195	15.5751	42.4104	0.1941	0.1410
A tot asset	(39.4601) 0.8051 (0.8898)	0.2353 (1.1078)	(38.6153) -1.7011 * (0.9412)	(00.5232) -1.8950 * (1.1271)	[ 0.5769 ] 1.9349 [ 0.9734 ]	[ 0.5561 ] 1.3480 [ 0.9110 ]

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

(日)、 - 3 BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016

37 / 45

Motivation	Econometric Model	Data	Empirical Analysis		Concluding Remarks		
	Simple	regression	Selection	correction	T-stat difference		
IT	-5.3730	2.1513	-0.8136	10.9651 *	-0.5891	-0.9788	
	(5.5120)	(6.3591)	(5.4327)	(6.3753)	[ 0.2780 ]	[ 0.1640 ]	
FR	6.4208	9.6956	-7.8743	35.6712 ***	1.2724	-1.8280	
	(7.8721)	(9.4197)	(8.0154)	(10.6393)	[ 0.8982 ]	[ 0.0339 ]	
ES	7.3184	-9.9276	8.7138	-9.1562	-0.1092	-0.0625	
	(9.1304)	(8.8161)	(8.9429)	(8.6224)	[ 0.4565 ]	[ 0.4751 ]	
NL	0.1365	-20.6351	-7.6851	-15.2179	0.5706	-0.3066	
	(9.7475)	(12.6118)	(9.6375)	(12.3784)	[ 0.7158 ]	[ 0.3796 ]	
GR	10.7974	-10.2980	10.9168	-5.7408	-0.0050	-0.1782	
	(17.1602)	(18.2703)	(16.7803)	(17.8894)	[ 0.4980 ]	[ 0.4293 ]	
UK	9.5135	-8.0704	1.9895	-11.9184	0.4623	0.2885	
	(11.5314)	(9.5098)	(11.4826)	(9.3498)	[ 0.6780 ]	[0.6135]	
US/JAP/EX	-0.8014	9.2517	-0.5150	14.4930	-0.0193	-0.2810	
	(10.5874)	(13.3213)	(10.3590)	(13.0572)	[ 0.4923 ]	[ 0.3894 ]	
AT	-2.7670	-5.0445	1.7754	-0.4491	-0.5499	-0.4910	
	(5.8758)	(6.6712)	(5.8060)	(6.5636)	[0.2913]	[0.3118]	
PT	5.3247	-22.1638 **	7.1816	-14.7469	-0.1513	-0.5494	
	(8.7659)	(9.5934)	(8.5896)	(9,4998)	[ 0.4399 ]	[0.2914]	
CY	()	-27.2089	()	-18.2724	1	-0.3817	
		(16.7152)		(16.3943)		[0.3514]	
EUEX	-0.9160	-22.6624 ***	-1.4285	-16.1408 **	0.0535	-0.5929	
	(6.8343)	(7.8358)	(6.7206)	(7.7185)	[0.5213]	[ 0.2767 ]	
Rates at t-1	-2797.4123 *	1946.0673	-2922.3237 *	733.2042	0.0557	0.5280	
	(1601.9363)	(1630.5859)	(1566.9273)	(1618.2008)	[0.5222]	[0.7012]	
Value at t-1	0.0546 ***	0.0203 ***	0.0395 ***	-0.0261 **	2.5184	3.5207	
	(0.0037)	(0.0066)	(0.0048)	(0.0114)	[ 0.9940 ]	[ 0.9998 ]	
# counterpart	satt-1 1.4814	-1.8501	0.9372	-1.2246	0.3077	-0.3441	
	(1.2597)	(1.2955)	(1.2412)	(1.2749)	[0.6208]	[ 0.3654 ]	
Connection at	t-1 13.46	27 ***	12.996	55 ***	0.1	194	
	(2.7	7910)	(2.7)	323)	[ 0.5	475 ]	
$\bar{R}^2$	0.3	3402	(	692	1		
Time interval	0.0		2010-01-20 - 20	10-02-09			
Maturity p			1 to 3 da		문에 주문어	ି≣ ୬୯୯	
Bank of It@lbsenvchfotocs	none holm University)		1067	BoF - Hels	inki, 25/8/201	6 38 / 45	

(Bank of It@lbservationskholm University)

### Snapshot (2010-01-20 - 2010-02-09) - Rates

	Simple r	Simple regression		Selection correction		ifference		
Mills Borrower		0.0398**						
Mills Lender	(0.0103) 0.0475*** (0.0182)							
	Lender	Borrower	Lender	Borrower	Lender	Borrower		
A loan	0.0163	-0.0460 ***	0.0145	-0.0396 ***	0.0841	-0.0298		
A fix as	(0.0133) 0.2910	(0.0145) 0.9290 ***	(0.0136) 0.3530	(0.0149) 1.0132 ***	[ 0.5335 ] -0.2312	[ 0.4881 ] -0.4014		
A non ern	(0.2739) 0.1006 **	(0.2981) -0.0532	(0.2753) 0.1114 **	(0.3061) -0.0619	[ 0.4086 ] 0.0468	[0.3441] -0.0175		
L. J. a. al. C.a.	(0.0488)	(0.0554)	(0.0491)	(0.0570)	[0.5187]	[0.4930]		
L dep sn fun	(0.0444)	(0.0345)	(0.0452)	(0.0526)	[ 0.4168 ]	[ 0.4810 ]		
L oth int bea	0.0461	0.0573	0.0689	0.0556	-0.0939 [ 0.4626 ]	-0.1052		
L oth res	-0.0826	-0.4602	0.1963	-0.6389	-0.1107	0.1622		
L equ	(0.5045) 0.0258	(0.5828) 0.3316 ***	(0.5165) 0.0457	(0.5985) 0.3033 **	[ 0.4559 ] -0.1446	[ 0.5644 ] 0.0104		
A tot asset	(0.0667) 0.0066 ***	(0.1155) -0.0052 ***	(0.0677) 0.0080 ***	(0.1177) -0.0047 **	[ 0.4425 ] -1.2526	[0.5042] -1.1767		
	(0.0015)	(0.0018)	(0.0016)	(0.0021)	[ 0.1053 ]	[ 0.1198 ]		

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) <□ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ト < □ ∧ < ○ </p>
BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 39 / 45

$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Simple regression		Selection	Selection correction		T-stat difference	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	IT	0.0096	0.0011	0.0162 *	-0.0032	-0.3541	0.7159	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0089)	(0.0094)	(0.0094)	(0.0096)	[ 0.3617 ]	[ 0.7629 ]	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	FR	-0.0029	-0.0038	-0.0017	0.0020	-0.0252	0.2393	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0131)	(0.0157)	(0.0141)	(0.0219)	[ 0.4900 ]	[ 0.5945 ]	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	ES	0.0138	-0.0061	0.0159	-0.0054	0.2196	0.2542	
NL $-0.0128$ $0.0061$ $-0.0124$ $0.0038$ $-0.1127$ $0.4059$ GR $(0.0168)$ $(0.0219)$ $(0.0170)$ $(0.0221)$ $[0.4551]$ $[0.6576]$ GR $-0.0411$ $0.0784$ ** $-0.0352$ $0.0749$ ** $-0.0169$ $0.2719$ UK $-0.0079$ $0.0226$ $0.0339$ $-0.523$ $0.2362$ $(0.0199)$ $(0.0160)$ $(0.0212)$ $(0.0165)$ $0.4741$ $0.5233$ $0.2362$ US/JAP/EX $-0.0311$ * $-0.0294$ $-0.0345$ * $-0.0345$ $0.2097$ $0.4740$ $(0.0179)$ $(0.0230)$ $(0.0133)$ $(0.0232)$ $(0.0138)$ $(0.0232)$ $[0.5830]$ $[0.6822]$ AT $-0.0089$ $-0.0150$ $-0.0064$ $-0.0138$ $0.0799$ $0.5175$ (0.0145) $(0.0166)$ $(0.0167)$ $[0.4973]$ $[0.6697]$ CY $0.0310$ ** $0.0360$ ** $0.0561$ *** $-0.0056$ $0.4380$ CY $0.0103$ <td< td=""><td></td><td>(0.0156)</td><td>(0.0150)</td><td>(0.0157)</td><td>(0.0152)</td><td>[ 0.5869 ]</td><td>[ 0.6003 ]</td></td<>		(0.0156)	(0.0150)	(0.0157)	(0.0152)	[ 0.5869 ]	[ 0.6003 ]	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	NL	-0.0128	0.0061	-0.0124	0.0038	-0.1127	0.4059	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0168)	(0.0219)	(0.0170)	(0.0221)	[ 0.4551 ]	[ 0.6576 ]	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	GR	-0.0411	0.0784 **	-0.0352	0.0749 **	-0.0169	0.2719	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		(0.0296)	(0.0315)	(0.0297)	(0.0316)	[ 0.4933 ]	[ 0.6071 ]	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	UK	-0.0079	0.0079	-0.0226	0.0039	-0.0523	0.2362	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		(0.0199)	(0.0160)	(0.0212)	(0.0165)	[ 0.4791 ]	[ 0.5933 ]	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	US/JAP/EX	-0.0311 *	-0.0294	-0.0345 *	-0.0345	0.2097	0.4740	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0179)	(0.0230)	(0.0183)	(0.0232)	[ 0.5830 ]	[ 0.6822 ]	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	AT	-0.0089	-0.0150	-0.0064	-0.0138	0.0799	0.5175	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0099)	(0.0113)	(0.0100)	(0.0114)	[ 0.5319 ]	[ 0.6975 ]	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	PT	0.0310 **	0.0566 ***	0.0360 **	0.0561 ***	-0.0056	0.4380	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0145)	(0.0166)	(0.0146)	(0.0167)	[ 0.4978 ]	[ 0.6693 ]	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	CY		0.1003 ***		0.0973 ***		0.3012	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$			(0.0289)		(0.0289)		[ 0.6183 ]	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	EUEX	-0.0104	0.0110	-0.0114	0.0094	0.1273	0.3548	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0116)	(0.0135)	(0.0119)	(0.0142)	[ 0.5506 ]	[ 0.6386 ]	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccc} (0.0744) & (0.0987) & [0.8593] \\ \hline \text{Connection at t-1} & -0.0081 ^{*} & -0.0076 ^{*} & -0.6167 \\ & (0.0045) & (0.0046) & [0.2688] \\ \hline \text{Quantity exchanged} & (0.0000 & -0.0000 & -0.7851 \\ & (0.0001) & (0.0001) & [0.2163] \\ \hline \bar{R}^2 & 0.2080 & 0.2172 \\ \hline \text{Time interval} & 2010-01-20 - 2010-02-09 \\ \hline \text{Maturity} & 1 \text{ to 3 days} \\ \hline \text{Observations} & 1067 \\ \hline \end{array} $	Constant	0.1	1089	-0.	0734	1.0	777	
$\begin{array}{c ccccc} \mbox{Connection at t-1} & -0.0081 * & -0.0076 * & -0.6167 \\ & & & & & & & & & & & & & & & & & & $		(0.0	)744)	(0.0	(0.0987)		[ 0.8593 ]	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Connection at t-1	-0.0	081 *	-0.0	076 *	-0.6	5167	
Quantity exchanged $(0.0000)$ $-0.0000$ $-0.7851^{-1}$ $(0.0001)$ $(0.0001)$ $[0.2163]$ $\bar{R}^2$ $0.2080$ $0.2172$ Time interval         2010-01-20 - 2010-02-09           Maturity         1 to 3 days           Observations         1067		(0.0	0045)	(0.0	0046)	[ 0.2	688 ]	
$\begin{array}{cccc} (0.0001) & (0.0001) & [0.2163] \\ \hline R^2 & 0.2080 & 0.2172 \\ \hline Time interval & 2010-01-20 - 2010-02-09 \\ Maturity & 1 to 3 days \\ Observations & 1067 \\ \hline \end{array}$	Quantity exchanged	(0.0000		-0.	0000	-0.7	7851	
$\begin{array}{ccccc} \bar{R}^2 & 0.2080 & 0.2172 \\ \hline {\rm Time \ interval} & 2010-01-20 & - 2010-02-09 \\ {\rm Maturity} & 1 \ {\rm to} \ 3 \ {\rm days} \\ Observations & 1067 \\ \hline \end{array}$		(0.0	0001)	(0.0	0001)	[ 0.2	163 ]	
Time interval         2010-01-20 - 2010-02-09           Maturity         1 to 3 days           Observations         1067	$\bar{R}^2$	0.2	2080	0.2	2172	-	-	
Maturity 1 to 3 days Observations 1067	Time interval			2010-01-20	- 2010-02-09			
Observations 1067	Maturity			1 to 3	8 days			
	Observations			10	67	_		

(Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016

40 / 45

## **Empirical Specification**

- To ease the computational burden we assume that  $\theta_{2b}$  and  $\gamma_{2l}$  are equal to zero,
- we set  $x_{bl,t} = [B_{l,t}, C_{l,t}, B_{b,t}, C_{b,t}, g_{lb,t-1}], z_{bl,t} = [B_{l,t}, C_{l,t}, B_{b,t}, C_{b,t}],$
- $k_b = [\bar{p}_{b,t-1}^B, q_{b,t-1}^B, n_{b,t-1}^B], \ k_l = [\bar{p}_{l,t-1}^L, q_{l,t-1}^L, n_{l,t-1}^L].$
- $B_{i,t}$  and  $C_{i,t}$  contain respectively the information about the balance sheet structure and nationality of bank *i* at time *t*.
- g<sub>ij,t</sub> is equal to 1 whether a loan with i as borrower and j as lender was observed at time t, it basically captures the persistence in the relationship between i and j.
- *p*<sup>B</sup><sub>i,t</sub> and *p*<sup>L</sup><sub>i,t</sub> are the average rates experienced respectively as borrower and as
   lender at time t by bank i, while *q*<sup>B</sup><sub>i,t</sub> and *q*<sup>L</sup><sub>i,t</sub> are the values exchanged
   respectively as borrower and as lender at time t by the bank i.
- $n_{i,t}^B$  and  $n_{i,t}^L$  are the number of counterparties respectively as borrower and as lender at time t by the bank i.
- These last three variables can be powerful explanatory variables respectively for borrower and lender shadow rates and work as exclusion restrictions in the estimation process. The presence of many financial crises during the time span considered provides frequent exogenous shocks to banks' shadow rates. For example, many lenders left the market suddenly. In our framework, it translates into significant changes of the supply acceptable region (the blue areas and the consequent exclusion of these banks from the market, no matter who the possible counterparts are.

# Diagnostics - Mills ratios non linearity

Rate equation. Diagnostics. Mills ratios non linearity and percentages of uncensored lenders and borrowers.



### **Diagnostics - Functional assumptions**

Dependent Var	iable: bilateral r	ate			
	Parametric		Semipara	ametric	
	Lender	Borrower	Lender	Borrower	
A loan	0.0163	-0.0460 ***	0.0145	-0.0396 ***	
	(0.0133)	(0.0145)	(0.0136)	(0.0149)	
A fix as	0.2910	0.9290 ***	0.3530	1.0132 ***	
	(0.2739)	(0.2981)	(0.2753)	(0.3061)	
A non ern	0.1006 **	-0.0532	0.1114 **	-0.0619	
	(0.0488)	(0.0554)	(0.0491)	(0.0570)	
L dep sh fun	0.1067 **	0.0345	0.1316 ***	0.0327	
	(0.0444)	(0.0487)	(0.0452)	(0.0526)	
L oth int bea	0.0461	0.0573	0.0689	0.0556	
	(0.0458)	(0.0491)	(0.0467)	(0.0535)	
L oth res	-0.0826	-0.4602	0.1963	-0.6389	
	(0.5045)	(0.5828)	(0.5165)	(0.5985)	
L equ	0.0258	0.3316 ***	0.0457	0.3033 **	
	(0.0667)	(0.1155)	(0.0677)	(0.1177)	
A tot asset	0.0066 ***	-0.0052 ***	0.0080 ***	-0.0047 **	
	(0.0015)	(0.0018)	(0.0016)	(0.0021)	
IT	0.0096	0.0011	0.0162 *	-0.0032	
	(0.0089)	(0.0094)	(0.0094)	(0.0096)	
FR	-0.0029	-0.0038	-0.0017	0.0020	
	(0.0131)	(0.0157)	(0.0141)	(0.0219)	
ES	0.0138	-0.0061	0.0159	-0.0054	
	(0.0156)	(0.0150)	(0.0157)	(0.0152)	
NL	-0.0128	0.0061	-0.0124	0.0038	
	(0.0168)	(0.0219)	(0.0170) 🗆 🕨	(0.0221)	•
00					

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016

43 / 45

### **Diagnostics - Functional assumptions**

	Para	metric	Semipa	arametric	
	Lender	Borrower	Lender	Borrower	
GR	-0.0411	0.0784 **	-0.0352	0.0749 **	
	(0.0296)	(0.0315)	(0.0297)	(0.0316)	
UK	-0.0079	0.0079	-0.0226	0.0039	
	(0.0199)	(0.0160)	(0.0212)	(0.0165)	
US/JAP/EX	-0.0311 *	-0.0294	-0.0345 *	-0.0345	
	(0.0179)	(0.0230)	(0.0183)	(0.0232)	
AT	-0.0089	-0.0150	-0.0064	-0.0138	
	(0.0099)	(0.0113)	(0.0100)	(0.0114)	
PT	0.0310 **	0.0566 ***	0.0360 **	0.0561 ***	
	(0.0145)	(0.0166)	(0.0146)	(0.0167)	
CY		0.1003 ***		0.0973 ***	
		(0.0289)		(0.0289)	
EUEX	-0.0104	0.0110	-0.0114	0.0094	
	(0.0116)	(0.0135)	(0.0119)	(0.0142)	
Connection at $t - 1$	-0.0	081 *	-0.0076 *		
	(0.0	0045)	(0.0	0046)	
Quantity exchanged	0.0	0000	-0.	0000	
	(0.0	0001)	(0.0	0001)	
Constant	0.1	L089	-0.	0734	
	(0.0	0744)	(0.0	0987)	
Time interval		2010-01-20	- 2010-02-09		
Maturity		1 to 3	3 days		
Observations		10	67		

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University)

BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 44 / 45

### **Diagnostics - Exclusion restrictions**

Dependent Variable: estimated	residuals					
		Rate equation		Q	uantity equation	
	Simple regression	Selection correction	Δ	Simple regression	Selection correction	Δ
Borrower rates at $t-1$	4.6453 ***	4.3973 **	0.0710	-0.0000	0.0000	-0.0000
Borrower value at $t-1$	(1.7471) -0.0000 ***	(1.7450) -0.0000 *	(0.4717) -0.4401	(1030.8095) 0.0000	(1006.9246) 0.0000	(0.5000)
Borrower $\#$ of cntrprts $t-1$	-0.0034 **	-0.0032 **	(0.3300) -0.0820	(0.0040) 0.0000	-0.0000	(0.5000)
Lender rates at $t-1$	(0.0014) 12.9894 *** (2.1022)	(0.0014) 12.4827 *** (2.1005)	0.1156	-0.0000	-0.0000	-0.0000
Lender value at $t-1$	-0.0000	0.0000	-0.2960 (0.3837)	0.0000	0.0000	-0.0000
Lender $\#$ of cntrprts $t-1$	-0.0107 *** (0.0017)	-0.0101 *** (0.0017)	-0.1677 (0.4334)	0.0000 (1.0158)	0.0000 (0.9923)	0.0000 (0.5000)
Time interval Maturity Observations			2010-01-20 1 to 3 10	- 2010-02-09 3 days 67		
Observations			10	07		

Edoardo Rainone (Bank of Italy and Stockholm University) ◆□ → ◆ 合 → ◆ 言 → ◆ 言 → ○ へ ○ BoF - Helsinki, 25/8/2016 45 / 45